

# Analyzing the Interobserver Variability in Stages of Tooth Development with Orthopantomogram (OPG)

Stella A, Jeevarathan J, Emmanuel Dhiravia Sargunam, Thirumalai Selvi

**Abstract** The development of teeth in human body follows a definitive chronological sequence. The different stages of formation of teeth have been used to evaluate the maturity and age of an individual. In dentistry, this estimation has been widely used to assess the growth for planning treatment. The legal system also uses this chronology to estimate the age of an individual, as there are various laws governing the adult and the juvenile in different countries, and dental age estimation has been widely used standard of age estimation when there are no legal records of age available. The aim was to study the agreement of the scoring pattern between different individuals while using the most popular techniques of Demirjian and Nollas for scoring for the age of an individual. To assess the accuracy and correlation of agreement between individuals for the various stages of tooth development as proposed by Demirjians and Nolla. To propose a system that is easily reproducible of the two. To assess the need for automation of the scoring system to eliminate human judgemental errors. 50 doctors were asked to score the OPG of 6 patients for the demirjians and nollas age assessment. They were assessed for agreement of various stages with the result closest to the age at the time of radiograph. The results were tabulated and tested statistically using interclass correlation co efficient and their statistical significance assessed. Both the tests had good correlation among clinicians for teeth 1<sup>st</sup> premolar and 1<sup>st</sup> molar. Rest of the teeth has mixed results. Demirjians had better correlation co efficient than the nollas technique. The differences in identification of the stages was statistically significant. Demirjians showed more agreement between the practitioners than Nollas but has statistically significant differences. This precludes the need for an automated system which will ensure reproducible scoring and age assessment.

**Index Terms:** Cronbach's Alpha ,Demirjian , Nollas and variability.

## I. INTRODUCTION

In the last decade there has been widespread influx of immigrants into the developed countries from the conflict

zones. One group of these immigrants is the unaccompanied minors. The organizations that provide services to these asylum seekers need the ages of these immigrants assessed to enable them to benefit from various government schemes for health and educational needs [1]. Errors in age assessment at this level can affect the individual as they may be required to stay in a higher or lower schooling level if there is an error in the assessment method. [1]

Many methods of age assessment are being carried out. Some are physical examinations that are carried out with pediatricians and others involve radiographic [2] and dental examinations [3] with Radiologist and Pediatric dentists respectively.

Radiological dental examination has few established techniques such as the Demirjians technique, the Nolla's technique [4] and the Carmeriere's [5] technique. These techniques have been used and modified around the world for accuracy and precision age in various ethnic groups.[6-13]

In all these dental radiographic techniques, the stage of tooth formation is the key to estimate the age of the individual. The calculation of the age therefore is fully dependent on identification of the right stage of development of teeth. Demirjian in his article has stated the different stages of tooth development and has numbered it A-H. The identification of these stages can change from one observer to the other creating errors in age assessment when done by one individual to another. Hence a study was planned to assess the severity of such errors so as to perceive the need for development of an error free assessment technique using advanced image processing technology.

## II. MATERIALS AND METHOD

The study was done using six randomly selected digital panoramic radiographs with known date of birth of the children, both gender males and females in mixed dentition period (7-15) years. Fifty practicing dentist were requested to score and estimate the age of the above children using Demirjian and Nolla stage of tooth development.

Fifty practicing dentist, were requested to score and estimate the age for 6 OPG which had the known date of birth and age at the time of X-rays. Among fifty entries only forty one has complete entries. Their options of stage of tooth development were checked with one of the entry among the forty one which gives the result closest to the age at the time of radiograph. The stages identified by the 40 dentist were then assessed for agreement for each tooth and the agreement was statistically analyzed for significance.

**Revised Manuscript Received on 30 March 2019.**

\* Correspondence Author

**Stella A\***, Department of Computer Science, Bharathiar University, Chennai, India.

**Jeevarathan J**, Department of Pedodontics and Preventive Dentistry, Sree Balaji Dental College and Hospitals, Chennai, India.

**Emmanuel Dhiravia Sargunam**, Professor, Department of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, Sri Ramachandra University, Chennai, India.

**Thirumalai Selvi**, Department of Computer Science, Govt Arts College (Men) Nandanam, Chennai, India.

© The Authors. Published by Blue Eyes Intelligence Engineering and Sciences Publication (BEIESP). This is an [open access](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/) article under the CC-BY-NC-ND license <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

## Analyzing The Interobserver Variability In Stages Of Tooth Development With Orthopantomogram (OPG)

Method	Tooth	N	Intraclass correlation coefficient (Cronbach's Alpha)	p value	Confidence Interval (CI)
Nollas	Central	40	0.272 (Poor agreement)	0.084	-0.143 to 0.572
Demirjians	Incisor		0.939 (Good agreement)	0.000	0.903 to 0.964

**TABLE 1:**The central incisors had good agreement in the Demirjians classification with a Inter class correlation of 0.939 and was statistically significant at P=0.000. where has Nollas had poor agreement.

Method	Tooth	N	Intraclass correlation coefficient (Cronbach's Alpha)	p value	Confidence Interval (CI)
Nollas	Lateral	40	0.366 (Poor agreement)	0.024	0.005 to 0.628
Demirjians	Incisor		0.660 (Moderate agreement)	0.000	0.380 to 0.840

**TABLE 2:**The agreement pattern in the Lateral incisors was lesser than Centrals and it was moderate for Demirjians (ICC 0.660)and Poor for Nollas (ICC 0.366).

Method	Tooth	N	Intraclass correlation coefficient (Cronbach's Alpha)	p value	Confidence Interval (CI)
Nollas	Canine	40	0.533 (Moderate agreement)	0.000	0.266 to 0.726
Demirjians			0.117 (Poor agreement)	0.287	-0.387 to 0.481

**TABLE 3:**In the Canine teeth Nollas classification showed moderate agreement (ICC 0.533) and very poor agreement for Demirjians (ICC 0.117)

Method	Tooth	N	Intraclass correlation coefficient (Cronbach's Alpha)	p value	Confidence Interval (CI)
Nollas	1 <sup>st</sup> premolar	40	0.938 (Good agreement)	0.000	0.902 to 0.963
Demirjians			0.992 (Good agreement)	0.000	0.877 to 0.984

**TABLE 4:**The first premolar showed good agreement for both Nollas (ICC 0.938) and Demirjians (0.992)

Method	Tooth	N	Intraclass correlation coefficient (Cronbach's Alpha)	p value	Confidence Interval (CI)
Nollas	2 <sup>nd</sup> premolar	40	0.163 (poor agreement)	0.216	-0.314 to 0.509
Demirjians			0.540 (Moderate agreement)	0.000	0.277 to 0.730

**TABLE 5:**In the second premolar the Nollas with an ICC 0.163 has poor agreement and the demirjian has ICC of 0.540.

Method	Tooth	N	Intraclass correlation coefficient (Cronbach's Alpha)	p value	Confidence Interval (CI)
Nollas	1 <sup>st</sup> Molar	40	0.920 (Good agreement)	0.000	0.874 to 0.953
Demirjians			0.925 (Good agreement)	0.000	0.882 to 0.956

**TABLE 6:**The First molar has good agreement in both with an ICC of 0.920 and 0.925 in nollas and demerjians technique respectively.

Method	Tooth	N	Intraclass correlation coefficient (Cronbach's Alpha)	p value	Confidence Interval (CI)
Nollas	2 <sup>nd</sup> Molar	40	0.619 (Moderate agreement)	0.000	0.402 to 0.776
Demirjians			0.759 (Good agreement)	0.000	0.622 to 0.859

**TABLE 7:**On evaluating the stage identification in the 2<sup>nd</sup> molars, there was moderate agreement in Nolla's (ICC 0.619) and Good agreement for demirjians (ICC 0.759)

Method	Tooth	N	Intraclass correlation coefficient (Cronbach's Alpha)	p value	Confidence Interval (CI)
Nollas	3 <sup>rd</sup> Molar	40	0.259 (Poor agreement)	0.097	-0.164 to 0.565

**TABLE 8:**On evaluating the stage identification in the 3<sup>rd</sup> molars, there was poor agreement in Nolla's (ICC 0.259)

For all intraclass reliability test has been done. Two- way mixed model, K raters type and consistency definition characteristics were used to do the statistics. Two-way mixed model has been used as specific raters are the only raters of interest (Dentist), which cannot be generalized to other population. K raters since there are about 40 dentists involved. Consistency definition was used since the raters were correlated in additive manner.

The overall results imply that there was mostly poor & moderate agreement between the raters. Though there is statistical significant p value, the cronbach's alpha value implies mostly poor to moderate agreement in both the methods (Nollas & Demirjians ).

In spite of few good agreements in both the methods, yet a clear gold standard image interpretation must be needed.

### III. RESULT

On doing intra-class reliability test, with two –way mixed model rates type and consistency definition characteristics the results showed poor agreement and good agreement in Nollas and Demirjians method for central incisor with P value of 0.08 and 0.00 respectively. Similarly for Lateral incisor the Cronbach's X value showed poor and moderate agreement in Nollas and Demirjians method with a P value of 0.02 and 0.00 respectively. Nollas and Demirjians method for Canine with a sample of 40 showed moderate and poor agreement with a P value of 0.00 and 0.28 respectively. For 1<sup>st</sup> molar the agreement was found to be good in both Nollas and Demirjians method with a P value of 0.00. Any way the agreement was poor and moderate in Nollas and Demirjians method with a P value of 0.21 and 0.00 respectively. Nollas and Demirjians method has good agreement for identification of 1<sup>st</sup> molar with a P value of 0.00. Anyway the agreement found to be moderate and good for 2<sup>nd</sup> molar with a P value of 0.00. Nollas method for identification of 3<sup>rd</sup> molar was found to have poor agreement with a P value of 0.09. Only 1<sup>st</sup> premolar and 1<sup>st</sup> molar has good agreement with cronbach's X value of 0.9 in both Nollas and Demirjians method. Intra class showed mostly poor and moderate agreement for the rest of the teeth in both the methods.

### IV. DISCUSSION

Age estimation has always been a challenging issue in both the living and the dead. While forensic age determination has varied tests and methods the estimation of age in living individuals especially minor children need noninvasive techniques.

The problems associated with asylum seekers and illegal migrants from the conflict zones of the world to developed countries accepting them on humanitarian grounds has increased the need for these techniques, as most of the minors sometime end up in migration camps without parents accompanying them[14],[15].

The developed countries themselves have a well-established public health, educational and legal systems which are sensitive to the age and development of the individual. Which means under estimation in an individual will result in undue benefits or overestimation of age can result in harsher punishments in legal system. Where as in the educational system they can be made to continue in a lower grade or can have problems in coping up with a higher grade class if the age estimation hadn't been accurate.

The demirjians and the Nolla's techniques have been the widely used techniques of age estimation till date. They also have undergone their fair share of reassessment to include the third molar in order to be more comprehensive and to extend their range of usefulness.

In a study from Brazil, the Nolla's method was found to be superior than the Demirjians technique for the local ethnic population [4]

In an indian study, there was an overestimation of age in the Demirjians technique compared to the Camerierie technique.[6]

When these techniques were used in other regions of the world like Peru [5], Brazil [4] india [6],[7],[11] iran [16] Italy [8]

Germany [9] Hongkong [10] Thailand[12] the reaserchers found that there as some difference in age and maturation between the ethnic groups. All these studies came with new formulae for age estimation based on the Demirjians Method.

The methods that used the corrective factors found the demirjians technique suitable for the euthenics group with the appropriate corrective factor [7],[16],[10]

There has been evidence that the identification of the stages of development of teeth are highly subjective and is prone to inter and intraobserver variability. These legal agencies and regulatory bodies need assessment that are reproducible and that s necessitates reduction in inter-observer variability.

Inter observer variability is a universal problem and is not ethnicity based. Which means though we develop ethnic group based formulae to use, the basic step of identification of the stage of development, if erred can confound the error further in following calculations.

This study aimed at assessing the problems in identifying the correct stage of tooth development. Forty dentists were asked to calculate the age of six OPG with mixed dentition. Their choice of the stages of tooth development of individual tooth was compared against the validated score of a senior pediatric dental consultant whose scoring yielded the actual age of the individual with an error of 3 months.

The individual scoring pattern was assessed with Intraclass correlation coefficient (Cronbach's Alpha) and was scored as good agreement -0.8 to 1, moderate agreement -0.6 to 0.7 and poor agreement <-0.5

The demirjians technique was a better technique compared to the Nollas as it scored good in 4 teeth and moderate in 2 and poor in 1 compared to good in 2 moderate in 2 and poor in 3 scored by the nolla's technique.

For an assessment to be accurate and reproducible in age estimation the identification of the developmental stage of the teeth needs to be accurate and in good agreement with the observer. The study has proved that though there are good agreement in teeth like the 1<sup>st</sup> molar and 1<sup>st</sup> premolar in both the technique, there is scope for improvement in the identification.

### V. CONCLUSION

The present study shows that there is an significant difference using cronbach's alpha value in both demirjians and Nolla's method. The human eye is trained to pick up patterns, but the mind can be influenced by other factors like time, stress need to do other work etc. resulting in errors in judgment.

This error in judgment can result in improper scoring and subsequent error in assessment of the age. This error can be between subsequent observers or by the same observer at a different time. Computerization or automation of the process using the image processing technology can be the solution to this issue of errors in identification of the correct stage of tooth development. This may be possible because machines do not have fatigue or are not influence by external factors. This opens the need for a better identification of the stages of tooth development.

## REFERENCES

1. Obertová, Z., Ratnayake, M., Poppa, P., Tutkuvienė, J., Ritz-Timme, S., & Cattaneo, C. (2018). Metric approach for age assessment of children: an alternative to radiographs? *Australian Journal of Forensic Sciences*, 50(1), 57–67.
2. Panchbhai, A. S. (2011). Dental radiographic indicators, a key to age estimation. *Dentomaxillofacial Radiology*, 40(4), 199–212.
3. Jurca, A., Lazar, L., Pacurar, M., Bica, C., Chibelea, M., & Bud, E. (2014). Dental age assessment using Demirjian's method: a radiographic study. *European Scientific Journal*, 10(36), 1857–7881.
4. Lopes, L. J., Nascimento, H. A. R., Lima, G. P., Santos, L. A. N. dos, Queluz, D. de P., & Freitas, D. Q. (2018). Dental age assessment: Which is the most applicable method? *Forensic Science International*, 284(2018), 97–100.
5. Quispe Lizarbe, R. J., Solís Adrianzén, C., Quezada-Márquez, M. M., Galić, I., & Cameriere, R. (2017). Demirjian's stages and Cameriere's third molar maturity index to estimate legal adult age in Peruvian population. *Legal Medicine*, 25, 59–65.
6. Nair, V. V., Thomas, S., Thomas, J., Fathima, S., Thomas, D., & Thomas, T. (2018). Comparison of Cameriere's and Demirjian's methods of age estimation among children in Kerala: a pilot study. *Clinics and Practice*.
7. Priyadarshini Chandramohan, Manjunath p. Puranik, S.R. Uma. Demirjian Method of Age Estimation using Correction Factor among Indian Children: A Retrospective Survey. *Journal of Indian Association of Public Health Dentistry*, 2018
8. Andrea Carlo Butti, Alberto Clivio, Monica Ferraroni, Elena Spada. Haavikko's method to assess dental age in Italian children. *European Journal of Orthodontics* 31(2009)150-155
9. Timme, M., Timme, W. H., Olze, A., Ottow, C., Ribbecke, S., Pfeiffer, H., ... Schmeling, A. (2017). Dental age estimation in the living after completion of third molar mineralization: new data for Gustafson's criteria. *International Journal of Legal Medicine*, 131(2), 569–577.
10. Jayaraman, J., Roberts, G. J., Wong, H. M., & King, N. M. (2018). Dental age estimation in southern Chinese population using panoramic radiographs: Validation of three population specific reference datasets. *BMC Medical Imaging*, 18(1), 4–11. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12880-018-0250-z>
11. Kumar, Vj., & Gopal, Ks. (2011). Reliability of age estimation using Demirjian's 8 teeth method and India specific formula. *Journal of Forensic Dental Sciences*, 3(1), 19.
12. P. Duangto, A. Janhom, S. Prasitwattanaseree, A. Iamaroon. New equations for age estimation using four permanent mandibular teeth in Thai children and adolescents. Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2018.
13. Farhan Dil, Mohammad Shiraz Alam, Syed Amjad Shah. The Variability Of Mandibular Third Molar Teeth Development And Its Application For Age Estimation In Peshawar Population. *JKCD March 2018, Vol. 8, No.1*
14. Jenista JA. The immigrant, refugee, or internationally adopted child. *Pediatr Rev*. 2001;22:419–429.
15. Jones VF, High PC, Donogue E, Fussell JJ, Gleason MM, Jaudes PK, Rubin DM, Schulte EE. Comprehensive health evaluation of the newly
16. R. J. Vidmar. (1992, August). On the use of atmospheric plasmas as electromagnetic reflectors. *IEEE Trans. Plasma Sci.* [Online]. 21(3). pp. 876–880. Available: <http://www.halcyon.com/pub/journals/21ps03-vidmar>

## AUTHORS PROFILE



**Stella A** Assistance professor, Ph.D scholar in Bharathiar University. I pursued my post graduate and M.Phil in the field of computer science. I have 7 years working experience as Assistance Professor in college affiliated to University of Madras, Tamil Nadu, India.



**Dr. Jeevarathan J**, completed his under graduation from Saveetha Dental College & Hospital in the year 1999 under Tamil Nadu Dr. M G R Medical University. He pursued his post graduation in the field of Paediatric and Preventive Dentistry in 2006 from Meenakshi Ammal Dental & College & Hospital under Tamil Nadu Dr. M G R Medical University. He has been in academics guiding

many undergraduate and postgraduate students. His interests in the field of pediatric dentistry are Trauma, Pediatric Orthodontics, Caries. He is one of the few people who use Nitrous Oxide Oxygen Inhalation Sedation in day today practice. He has proposed a Classification for Talon Cusp and Dens

Evaginatus and has contributed few Chapters in Pedaitirc Textbooks. He has given numerous guest lectures in various conferences and CDE programs.



**Dr Emmanuel Dhiravia Sargunam** graduated from saveetha Dental College and Ragas Dental College in Chennai. He is currently Associate Professor and Consultant at Faculty of Dental Sciences, Sri Ramachandra University, Chennai. He has also completed his fellowship from Indian Board of OMFS (IBOMS) and International Board (IBCSOMS). He has been in academics guiding many undergraduate and postgraduate students. He has given numerous guest lectures in various conferences.



**Dr. (Mrs.) R. Thirumalai Selvi** is currently the research supervisor and Assistant Professor in the department of Computer Science, Govt. Arts College (Men) (Autonomous), Chennai. She has over 20+ years of experience in various arts and science colleges and as a research supervisor. She is guiding many PhD students registered under various universities.